

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2001/09/03 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100020003-0
ATTACHMENT C

NATIONAL SECURITY COUNCIL INTELLIGENCE COMMITTEE WORKING GROUP

Draft Minutes of the Fourteenth Meeting
1430 Hours, 2 July 1975
White House Situation Room

Chairman: Lt. Gen. Samuel V. Wilson, D/DCI/IC

Members present: Mr. Charles Flowerree, Department of State
(representing Mr. George S. Vest, Director,
Bureau of Politico-Military Affairs)
Mr. Robert Ellsworth, Assistant Secretary of
Defense (International Security Affairs)
Mr. William N. Morell, Special Assistant to the
Secretary of the Treasury for National
Security
RADM Robert P. Hilton, JCS (representing Lt. Gen.
John H. Elder, J-5, Plans and Policy)
Mr. Richard Ober, NSC Staff, Director for
International Coordination

Briefers: Mr. James R. Hays, DIA/Directorate for Collection
25X1A9a [REDACTED] IC Staff

Others present: VADM E. F. Rectanus, with Mr. Ellsworth
RADM Donald Harvey, with RADM Hilton
Captain Gerald N. Dyer, with RADM Hilton
Lt. Colonel William Fielder, with Mr. Hays
Major Frank Zachar, with Mr. Hays

Agenda Item 1: Approval of Minutes and Organizational Notice

1. The revised draft minutes of the 20 May meeting were approved.
 2. General Wilson announced that effective prior to the next meeting Lt. Gen. Brent Scowcroft would become the new Chairman.
- General Wilson said he welcomed this as a necessary step in making the Working Group truly the voice of the consumer.

NSC Declassification/Release Instructions on File

Approved For Release 2001/09/03 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100020003-0

~~SECRET~~

CLASSIFIED BY 033245
EXEMPT FROM GENERAL DECLASSIFICATION
SCHEDULE OF E. O. 11652, EXEMPTION CATEGORY:
§ 5B(1), (2), (3) or (4) (circle one or more)
AUTOMATICALLY DECLASSIFIED ON
Impossible to determine
(unless impossible, insert date or event)

~~SECRET~~

Agenda Item 2: MBFR Briefing

3. Mr. James Hays of the Directorate of Collections in DIA gave a presentation on Intelligence Issues in Mutual and Balanced Force Reduction considerations. This briefing was in response to a recommendation by Ambassador Ellsworth, and was given at the TS level mainly in order to cover discussion of specific collection systems. Most of the briefing and attendant discussion was at a lower level of classification.

4. Ambassador Ellsworth made several points in reaction to the briefing, e.g.:

--Apart from the Soviet and East European authorities who would object to Western observers seeking to verify an MBFR agreement, the West Germans have indicated that they would not welcome Russian observers on their territory for the same purpose.

--Given the uncertainties exposed in this briefing, the problem of monitoring the Warsaw Pact forces in the NATO Guidelines Area (NGA) is pressing even in the absence of an MBFR agreement.

5. Admiral Rectanus also made a number of observations, and raised the question of whether the Pact could use qualitative improvements in the capabilities of the forces to offset quantitative changes effected under an MBFR agreement. The DIA briefer conceded that this was theoretically possible but stressed that qualitative changes were easier to detect than quantitative changes.

~~SECRET~~

6. Mr. Flowerree addressed various ways of enhancing our MBFR monitoring capabilities. For example, he asked, would it be worthwhile to negotiate freedom of air intelligence collection along certain corridors and borders? The DIA briefer agreed that this would be helpful, if it would be successfully negotiated; so would an agreement to allow personal inspection teams to cover the area (say) 5 times a year.

7. There were several other comments on the topic. In closing this portion of the meeting, General Wilson underscored the worrisome implications of the DIA estimate that the Pact forces in the NGA could achieve as much as a 20 percent increase in size over a one year period without detection.

Agenda Item 3: Status Report

8. The Chairman reported that the Objectives paper, which consisted of both substantive objectives and milestones in resource management--the latter portion at least partly responsive to Admiral Hilton's concerns--had been approved by USIB and would be submitted to IRAC. Working Group members would have the opportunity to comment again on the paper, but this time their comments should go directly to NSCIC.

9. The Chairman reported that the paper on specific statement of uncertainties was being worked on in pieces. One of these, a paper on expressing uncertainties in technical judgments was now being staffed through GMAIC. Ambassador Ellsworth and Mr. Morell both

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2001/09/03 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100020003-0

made clear that such a paper, while useful, would answer only a part of their requirements on this subject.

10. Among other business the Chairman reported that as a followup to the Mayaguez post-mortem he had arranged for meetings involving representatives of watch officers and operations centers to discuss ways of improving the handling of critical intelligence. The guide to community production and consumer contact points had been revised per the recommendations of the Working Group and would be published shortly. A draft on the staffing and distribution of the Family of National Intelligence Guidance Documents, circulated to the members, ~~2001X4~~ would be revised for formal dissemination later. A followup paper on [REDACTED] prepared at the request of Treasury, had been distributed.

Agenda Item 4: TRs for NSCIC Working Group

11. Mr. Morell noted that the assumptions about organization, arrangements, systems, and the like in the draft TRs are now suspect. Whatever is decided through the Rockefeller and Murphy Reports about NSCIC will inevitably "rub" on us. Therefore we are "starting on the wrong end."

12. Mr. Ober observed, however, that we can do much of the drafting prior to the next meeting, and save final decisions until then. He wanted to get comments from the members as soon as possible. Ambassador Ellsworth called attention to Mr. Ober's paper on the work program for (sub)committee(s) of the NSCIC Working Group and proposed that the Ober paper be factored in to the revised TRs.

Approved For Release 2001/09/03 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100020003-0

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2001/09/03 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100020003-0

13. With regard to the membership of the committee, General Wilson expressed the desire that Mr. Ober chair it. Mr. Ober said that he hoped all nominees for the committee would be users of intelligence, rather than producers.

Agenda Item 5: Intelligence Issues in Warning

14. This item, originally planned as item 5, was discussed immediately after the MBFR briefing, per decision of the Chairman.

15. [REDACTED] of the IC Staff discussed the distinction that separates warning from estimates or forecasts: warning implies decisions to take actions. That is, the convergence and summation of the indicators lead to an analysis that in turn leads to a decision to take an action. The action generates indicators to an opponent, and an action-reaction cycle takes place. [REDACTED] provided illustrations of the complexity of this cycle from the Japanese decision process leading to Pearl Harbor and the Middle East War of October 1973. He then briefly reviewed efforts in the Community to use improved communication techniques to converge critical information. Beyond that, he stressed the need for the Community to make warning statements in probabilistic terms, and the importance for the consumer to accept probabilistic warning estimates because they concern the type of decision (from drastic down to none) he is attempting to make.

16. There were several minutes of general discussion on this briefing. The Chairman said he realized that this briefing was "tutorial" in nature. The main point is there is a need to develop a common

Approved For Release 2001/09/03 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100020003-0

~~SECRET~~

~~SECRET~~

Approved For Release 2001/09/03 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100020003-0

language between producers and consumers and this type of approach is one useful step toward that end. There was general agreement with the Chairman's comments.

Next Meeting

17. There was agreement that the new Chairman would schedule the next meeting for August. Ambassador Ellsworth expressed, on behalf of the other members, congratulations to General Wilson for his efforts as Chairman to get things moving.

25X1A9a

Executive Secretary
NSCIC Working Group

Approved For Release 2001/09/03 : CIA-RDP84B00506R000100020003-0

~~SECRET~~

Distribution:

Original - PRD Subject
1 - George S. Vest, Leslie H. Brown
1 - Robert F. Ellsworth
1 - William N. Morell, Jr.
1 - Lt. Gen. John H. Elder, Jr.
1 - Richard Ober
1 - VADM E. F. Rectanus
1 - Anthony Cordesman
1 - Lt. Gen. Brent Scowcroft
1 - Edward Proctor 25X9A81
1 - William McAfee
1 - [REDACTED]
1 - Lt. Gen. Eugene F. Tighe, Jr.
1 - George Carver 25X1A9a
1 - Maj. Gen. [REDACTED]
1 - General Wilson
1 - C/PRD (& PRD Chrono)
1 - IC Registry
1 - AB Subject
1 - WMH Chrono

DCI/IC/PRD/[REDACTED] fn x4445 (18 July 75)

25X1A9a